

**Boğaziçi University**

**Spring 2019**

**ATA 68B / SOC 496 – Directed Research & Readings: Science, Religion, Culture**

**Instructor:** Dr. Kutluğhan Soyubol – kutlughan.soyubol@boun.edu.tr

**Course Description:** This is an interdisciplinary course designed to interrogate some specific themes and discussions within the history, anthropology, sociology and philosophy of religion and science. During the course, we will try to chart our way through some big picture ideas on science, religion and culture, and focus on a number of specific issues, including but not limited to, the discussions of objectivity, nature, modern medicine, occult, psy-sciences, evolution, biopolitics, ethics, agency, expertise, geography, social construction, and affect. The course aims not to prioritize any specific discipline or period, nor it does follow any chronology. It instead attempts to think across disciplines thematically and intends to encourage students to chart their own ways beyond disciplinary demarcations. The course is open to senior and graduate students only. Consent of the instructor is required.

**Course Requirements:**

1) Participation: Weekly presentations, attendance, and class participation: 30%

This is a seminar course in which active participation is crucial. Students are thus expected to read the required materials in advance of class meetings and come to the class ready to engage in weekly discussions. Every week a small group of students will be assigned to briefly present hence start the discussion for one of the required readings. The presentations should be approximately ten minutes and address the following questions: What are the author's main arguments? What is the theoretical framework that these arguments are built on? And the evidence used to support them?

2) Two critical response papers (3-4 pages, double spaced) written on texts presented in class: 20%

3) Final Paper: A literature review paper (12-15 pages, double spaced, including references) on one of the weekly themes of the seminar: 50%

**Schedule:**

This schedule is tentative and subject to change. Necessary announcements will be made in the classroom.

**Week 1: Introduction to the course**

**Week 2: Demarcations, Conflict, Commensurability**

Required Readings: Michel Foucault, "What is Enlightenment?" in Paul Rabinow (ed.) *The Foucault Reader* (New York: Pantheon, 1984), pp. 32-50.

Mary Baine Campbell, Lorraine Daston, Arnold I. Davidson, John Forrester, Simon Goldhill, "Enlightenment Now: Concluding Reflections on Knowledge and Belief" *Common Knowledge* 13/2-3 (2007), pp. 429-450.

Peter Harrison, "Territories of Science and Religion"; "Science and the Origins of 'Religion'" in *Territories of Science and Religion* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2015), pp. 1-20; (optional) 83-116.

Suggested Readings: Thomas Dixon, *Science and Religion: A Very Short Introduction* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008) (or) Alister E. McGrath, *Science and Religion: A New Introduction* (Malden, MA: Wiley-Blackwell, 2009), pp. 1-54.

Stephen Jay Gould, "Nonoverlapping Magisteria" *Natural History* 106/2 (1997), pp. 16-22.

Albert Einstein, "About Religion" in *Ideas and Opinions* (New York: Crown Publishers, 1954), pp. 36-53.

Katharine Park and Lorraine Daston, "Introduction: The Age of the New" in *The Cambridge History of Science Volume 3: Early Modern Science* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), pp. 1-20.

Michael Allen Gillespie, "Introduction" and "The Contradictions of Enlightenment and the Crisis of Modernity" *The Theological Origins of Modernity* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2008), pp. 1-18; 255-288.

Jonathan Sheehan, "Enlightenment, Religion, and the Enigma of Secularization: A Review Essay" *American Historical Review* 108/4 (2003), pp. 1061-1080.

B. Harun Küçük, "Islam, Christianity, and the Conflict Thesis" in Thomas Dixon et al. (eds.) *Science and Religion: New Historical Perspectives* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011), pp. 111-130.

M. Alper Yalçinkaya, "Science as an Ally of Religion: a Muslim Appropriation of 'the Conflict Thesis'" *British Journal for the History of Science* 44/2 (2011), pp. 161-181.

### **Week 3: Objectivity, Subjectivity, Social Construction**

Required Readings: Ian Hacking, "Why Ask What?" in *The Social Construction of What?* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1999), pp. 1-34.

Lorraine Daston and Peter Galison, "The Image of Objectivity" *Representations* 40 (1992), pp. 81-128.

Suggested Readings: Lorraine Daston and Peter Galison, "The Scientific Self"; "Structural Objectivity"; "Representation to Presentation" in *Objectivity* (New York: Zone Books, 2007), pp. 191-251; 253-307; 363-415.

Thomas S. Kuhn, "Introductory Essay by Ian Hacking"; "Introduction: A Role for History"; "The Nature and Necessity of Scientific Revolutions"; "Process through Revolutions" in *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2012), pp. vii-xxxviii; 1-9; 92-110; 159-172.

Steven Shapin, "Cordelia's Love: Credibility and the Social Studies of Science" *Perspectives on Science* 3/3 (1995), pp. 255-275.

### **Week 4: Nature, Science, Modernity**

Required Readings: Bruno Latour, "Crisis"; "Constitution"; and "Relativism" in *We Have Never Been Modern* Trans. Catherine Porter (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1993), pp. 1-12; 13-48; (optional) 91-129.

Pierre Hadot, "Experimental Science and Mechanization of Nature" in *The Veil of Isis: An Essay on the History of the Idea of Nature* Trans. Michael Chase (Cambridge, MA: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2006), pp. 118-137; (optional) 91-98; 101-117; 138-151.

Suggested Readings: Steven Shapin and Simon Schaffer, “Understanding Experiment” and “The Trouble with the Experiment: Hobbes versus Boyle” in *Leviathan and the Air-Pump* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1985, 2011), pp. 3-21; 110-154.

Bruno Latour, *On the Modern Cult of the Factish Gods* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2010), pp. 1-66.

### **Week 5: Mapping/Unmapping Science**

Required Readings: David N. Livingstone, “A Geography of Science?” in *Putting Science in Its Place: Geographies of Scientific Knowledge* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2003), pp. 1-16.

Marwa Elshakry, “When Science Became Western: Historiographical Reflections” *Isis* 101/1 (2010), pp. 98-109.

Walter D. Mignolo, “I am Where I Do: Remapping the Order of Knowing” in *The Darker Side of Western Modernity: Global Futures, Decolonial Options* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2011), pp. 77-117.

Suggested Readings: Peter Dear, “What Is the History of Science the History Of? Early Modern Roots of the Ideology of Modern Science” *Isis* 96/3 (2005), pp. 390-406.

Dipesh Chakrabarty, “Introduction: The Idea of Provincializing Europe” in *Provincializing Europe: Postcolonial Thought and Historical Difference* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2000), pp. 3-23.

Gyan Prakash, “The Sign of Science” and “Divided Love” in *Another Reason: Science and the Imagination of Modern India* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1999), pp. 1-14; 227-237.

### **Week 6: Occult, Science, Magic**

Required Readings: Jason A. Josephson-Storm, “Introduction”; “Enchanted (Post) Modernity”; “Conclusion: The Myth of Modernity” in *The Myth of Disenchantment: Magic, Modernity, and the Birth of the Human Sciences* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2017), pp. 1-21; 22-40; 302-316.

Thomas Lacqueur, “Why the Margins Matter: Occultism and the Making of Modernity” *Modern Intellectual History* 3/1 (2006), pp. 111-135.

Graham M. Jones, “Dangerous Doubles”; “An Anthropologist among the Spirits”; “Regimes of Enchantment” in *Magic’s Reason: An Anthropology of Analogy* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2017), pp. 1-26; (optional) 96-114; 159-166.

Suggested Readings: Joshua Landy and Michael Saler, “Introduction: The Varieties of Modern Enchantment” in Joshua Landy and Michael Saler (eds.) *The Re-Enchantment of the World: Secular Magic in a Rational Age* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2009), pp. 1-14.

Bernard Dionysius Geoghegan, “Mind the Gap: Spiritualism and the Infrastructural Uncanny” *Critical Inquiry* 42/4 (2016), pp. 899-922.

Jeffrey J. Kripal, “Introduction: Off the Page” and “Conclusion: Back on the Page” in *Authors of the Impossible: The Paranormal and The Sacred* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2010), pp. 5-35; 251-272.

Simon During, "Enchantment and Loss: Theorizing Secular Magic" in *Modern Enchantments: The Cultural Power of Secular Magic* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2002), pp. 43-73.

### **Week 7: Brain, Selfhood, Power**

Fernando Vidal, "Brainhood, Anthropological Figure of Modernity" *History of the Human Sciences* 22/1 (2009), pp. 5-36.

Nima Bassiri, "Freud and the Matter of the Brain: On the Rearrangements of Neuropsychanalysis" *Critical Inquiry* 40/1 (2013), pp. 83-108.

Nikolas Rose, "Introduction" and "Psychology as an Individualizing Technology" in *Inventing our Selves: Psychology, Power, and Personhood* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998), pp. 1-21; 101-115.

Suggested Readings: Ian Hacking, "Making up People" in *Historical Ontology* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2002), pp. 99-114.

Michel Foucault, "One: 7 November 1973" in *Psychiatric Power: Lectures at the College de France 1973-1974* Trans. Graham Burchell (New York: Palgrave, 2006), pp. 1-18.

Fernando Vidal, "Brains, Bodies, Selves, and Science: Anthropologies of Identity and the Resurrection of the Body" *Critical Inquiry* 28/4 (2002), pp. 930-974.

Catherine Malabou, *What Should We Do with Our Brain?* Trans. Sebastian Rand (New York: Fordham University Press, 2008)

### **Week 8: Islam, Psy-sciences, the "Imaginal"**

Required Readings: Stefania Pandolfo, *The Knot of the Soul: Madness, Psychoanalysis, Islam* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2018), pp. TBD

Omnia El Shakry, "Psychoanalysis and the Imaginary: Translating Freud in Postcolonial Egypt" *Psychoanalysis and History* 20/3 (2018), pp. 293-311.

Suggested Readings: Alireza Doostdar, "Empirical Spirits" and "Scientific Virtues" in *The Iranian Metaphysicals: Explorations in Science, Islam, and the Uncanny* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2018), pp. 112-122; 123-135.

Kutluğhan Soyubol, "Turkey Psychoanalyzed, Psychoanalysis Turkified: The Case of İzzettin Şadan" *Comparative Studies of South Asia, Africa and the Middle East* 38/1 (2018), pp. 57-72.

Ana Vinea, "An Emergent Affliction in Today's Egypt: Islamic Healing, the Psy Sciences, and What Lies in-between" *Medicine Anthropology Theory* 5/1 (2018)

Nouri Gana, "Jihad on the Couch" *Psychoanalysis and History* 20/3 (2018), pp. 371-386.

### **Week 9: Ethics, Morality, Politics**

Required Readings: Daniel Callahan, "The Social Sciences and the Task of Bioethics" *Daedalus* (1999), pp. 275-294.

Sherine Hamdy, "Transplanting God's Property: The Ethics of Scale" and "Only One Kidney to Give: Ethics and Risk" in *Our Bodies Belong to God: Organ Transplants, Islam, and the Struggle for Human Dignity in Egypt* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2012), pp. 141-171; 173-207.

Suggested Reading: Benjamin Hurlbut, "Introduction: The Politics of Experiment" and "Religion, Reason, and the Politics of Progress" in *Experiments in Democracy: Human Embryo Research and the Politics of Bioethics* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2017), pp. 1-38; 233-262.

### **Week 10: Biopolitics, Expertise, Turkey**

Required Readings: Michel Foucault, "About the Concept of the 'Dangerous Individual' in 19<sup>th</sup> century Legal Psychiatry" *International Journal of Law and Psychiatry* 1/1 (1978), pp. 1-18.

Robert Castel, "From Dangerousness to Risk" in Graham Burchell et al. (eds.) *The Foucault Effect: Studies in Governmentality* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991), pp. 281-298.

Sanem Güvenç Salgırlı, "Eugenics for the Doctors: Medicine and Social Control in 1930s Turkey" *Journal of the History of Medicine and Allied Sciences* 66/3 (2011), pp. 281-312.

Kyle Thomas Evered and Emine Önhan Evered, "An Atlas of Maladies, Microbes, & Morals: Tropes of Scientism in Early Turkey's Public Health Education," *Historical Geography* 44 (2016), pp. 102-126.

Suggested Readings: Paul A. Lombardo, "Introduction" and "Epilogue: Reconsidering Buck" in *Three Generations, No Imbeciles: Eugenics, the Supreme Court, and Buck v. Bell* (Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2010), pp. ix-xiv; 267-280.

Fahrettin Kerim Gökyay, "İrk Hıfzıssıhhasında İrsiyetin Rolü ve Nesli Tereddiden Korumak Çareleri" in *CHP Konferanslar Dizisi, Kitap: 12* (Ankara: Recep Usluoğlu Basımevi, 1940), pp. 11-15.

Christopher Dole, "In the Shadows of Medicine and Modernity: Medical Integration and Secular Histories of Religious Healing in Turkey" *Culture, Medicine and Psychiatry* 28/3 (2004), pp. 255-280.

### **Week 11: Evolution, Genesis, Hermeneutics**

Required Readings: Jonathan Marks, "Science, Religion, and Worldview" in *What It Means to be 98% Chimpanzee: Apes, People, and their Genes* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2003), pp. 266-288.

Marwa Elshakry, "Muslim Hermeneutics and Arabic Views of Evolution" *Zygon* 46/2 (2011), pp. 330-344.

Christopher Southgate, "Re-reading Genesis, John, and Job: A Christian Response to Darwinism" *Zygon* 46/2 (2011), pp. 370-395.

Richard Dawkins, Rowan Williams, and Anthony Kenny, "The Nature of Human Beings and Their Ultimate Origin" Debate, Oxford University, 23 February 2012.

Suggested Readings: Jonathan Marks, "The Problem of Creationism" in *Why I am not a Scientist: Anthropology and Modern Knowledge* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2009), pp. 103-128.

Daniel C. Dennett and Alvin Plantinga, *Science and Religion: Are They Compatible?* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010), chapters 1 and 2 or preferably the whole debate.

Alper Bilgili, "An Ottoman Response to Darwinism: İsmail Fennî on Islam and Evolution" *British Journal for the History of Science* 48/4 (2015), pp. 565-582.

M. Asım Karaömerlioğlu, "Darwin ve Sosyal Bilimler," *Birikim* 251 (2010), pp. 111-122.

Peter J. Bowder, "Evolution"; and Ronald L. Numbers, "Creationism since 1859" in Gary B. Ferngren (ed.) *Science and Religion: A Historical Introduction* (Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2002), pp. 219-233; 277-288.

### **Week 12: Sex, Gender, Sexuality**

Required Readings: Arnold I. Davidson, "Sex and the Emergence of Sexuality" in *The Emergence of Sexuality: Historical Epistemology and the Formation of Concepts* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2001), pp. 30-65.

Howard Chiang, "Epistemic Modernity and the Emergence of Homosexuality in China" *Gender & History* 22/3 (2010), pp. 629-657.

Afsaneh Najmabadi, "Verdicts of Science, Rulings of Faith: Transgender/Sexuality in Contemporary Iran" *Social Research* 78/2 (2011), pp. 533-556.

Suggested Readings: Judith Butler, "Introduction" in *Bodies That Matter: On the Discursive Limits of Sex* (London: Routledge, 1993), pp. xi-xxx.

Joseph Massad, "Re-Orienting Desire: The Gay International and the Arab World" *Public Culture* 14/2 (2002), pp. 361-385.

### **Week 13: Species, Agency, Affect**

Required Readings: Donovan O. Schaefer, "Introduction: Species, Religious Studies, and the Affective Turn" in *Religious Affects: Animality, Evolution, and Power* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2015), pp. 1-18.

Denise Kimber Buell, "The Microbes and Pneuma That Therefore I am" in Stephen D. Moore (ed.) *Divinanimality: Animal Theory, Creaturely Theology* (New York: Fordham University Press, 2014), pp. 63-87.

Timothy Mitchell, "Can the Mosquito Speak?" in *Rule of Experts: Egypt, Techno-Politics, Modernity* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2002), pp. 19-53.

Suggested Readings: Dipesh Chakrabarty, "The Climate of History: Four Theses," *Critical Inquiry* 35/2 (2009), pp. 197-222.

Donna J. Haraway, "When Species Meet: Introductions" in *When Species Meet* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2008), pp. 3-42. (or) idem., "Tentacular Thinking: Anthropocene, Capitalocene, Chthulucene" in *Staying with the Trouble: Making Kin in the Chthulucene* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2016), pp. 30-57.

Cary Wolfe, "Introduction: What is Posthumanism?" in *What is Posthumanism?* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2010), p. xi-xxxiv.

### **Week 14: Conclusions**