

ATA 59G  
PUTTING REDISTRIBUTION, WEALTH & CAPITAL ACCUMULATION  
AT THE CENTER OF REPUBLICAN HISTORY  
Fall 2023

*Nadir Özbek*

Wednesday 10:00-13:00

Office Hrs: Wednesday 14:00-16:00 and by appointment.

e-mail: nadir.ozbek@gmail.com

Course Description: The seminar introduces students to issues ranging from capital accumulation, social justice, inequality, social welfare, income distribution, wealth and poverty, and taxation both in Ottoman and Turkish history and in contemporary world. We'll pay special attention to fiscal systems and taxation as an instrument of distribution. During the first part of the semester we are going to make common readings which will provide students with conceptual tools and help them formulate own research agendas and questions as to Ottoman/Turkish history and contemporary society. As part of course requirements students are expected to carry out one small research project and an in-class book report, both should be related to the general issues that we will be discussing throughout the first part of the semester. Research topics and books for report may be on historical issues, as well as on contemporary social problems.

Themes and Weekly Readings:

Week I: Introduction:

Week II: Conceptual Background I:

Property reconsidered: The Commons, Enclosures, and Resistance:

Linebaugh, Peter. 2014. Stop, Thief!: *The Commons, Enclosures, and Resistance*. Oakland: Spectre. pp.1-10.

Linebaugh, Peter. *The Magna Carta Manifesto: Liberties and Commons for All*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2008. pp.1-20; 269-280.

**Video:** Peter Linebaugh: Who Owns the Commons? An 800 Year Fight for Public goods  
[https://www.youtube.com/results?search\\_query=peter+linebaugh](https://www.youtube.com/results?search_query=peter+linebaugh)

**Video:** Peter Linebaugh - Magna Carta and the Commons:  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1PofdWRNRbQ>

Week III: Conceptual Background II:

Marx and Primitive Accumulation:

Marx, Carl. "Part Eight: So-Called Primitive Accumulation." In *Capital: A Critique of Political Econom*, 871-940. London: Penguin Classics, 1990. De Angelis, Massimo.

2001. "Marx and Primitive Accumulation: The Continuous Character of Capital's "Enclosures"." *The Commoner* 2.

Pradella, Lucia. 2014. *Globalization and the Critique of Political Economy: New Insights*

from Marx's Writings. London: Routledge.

**Video:** Towards a Global History of Primitive Accumulation Conference / International Institute of Social History  
[https://www.youtube.com/playlist?list=PL0inCva4xJeMS64vE5Vy-97YcVsygo\\_Qd](https://www.youtube.com/playlist?list=PL0inCva4xJeMS64vE5Vy-97YcVsygo_Qd)

Week IV: Conceptual Background III:

New Debates on Primitive Accumulation:

De Angelis, Massimo. "Marx and Primitive Accumulation: The Continuous Character of Capital's "Enclosures"." *The Commoner* 2 (01/01 2001).

Goncalves, Guilherme Leite, and Sergio Costa. 2020. "From Primitive Accumulation to Entangled Accumulation: Decentring Marxist Theory of Capitalist Expansion." *European Journal of Social Theory* 23 (2): 146-164.

**Video:** Commons and Social Movements by Massimo De Angelis

[https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=K6\\_gTm5zUJo](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=K6_gTm5zUJo)

**Video:** Revolutionary Commoning: A Vision from the Eighteenth Century | Marcus Rediker

[https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=8FGfp7G\\_5CI](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=8FGfp7G_5CI)

Week V: Conceptual Background IV:

Political Economy of Redistribution, Wealth and Capital Accumulation:

Piketty, Thomas. 2015. "Putting Distribution Back at the Center of Economics: Reflections on Capital in the Twenty-First Century." *Journal of Economic Perspectives* 29 (1): 67-88.

Boratav, Korkut. "'21. Yüzyılda Kapital" Üzerine Notlar." *Ankara Üniversitesi Siyasal Bilimler Fakültesi Dergisi* 69, no. 3 (2014): 597-624.

**Video:** Thomas Piketty: New thoughts on capital in the twenty-first century:

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=JKsHhXwqDqM>

Week VI: Economic History of Early Republican Turkey I:

Old and New Paradigms!

Boratav, Korkut. *Türkiye İktisat Tarihi, 1908-2009*. Ankara: İmge Kitabevi Yayınları, 2011. pp.13-116.

Pamuk, Şevket. *Uneven Centuries: Economic Development of Turkey Since 1820*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2018. pp.184-203.

Keyder, Çağlar. *State and Class in Turkey: A Study in Capitalist Development*. London: Verso, 1987. pp.71-115.

Pamuk, Şevket. 2013. "Son İki Yüzyılda Türkiye'de Gelirin Bölüşümü." *ODTÜ Gelişme Dergisi* (40): 297-316.

**Video:** Korkut Boratav: Türkiye'de Sınıfların İzini Sürmek

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zyzR8CATDoo>

Week VII: Economic History of Early Republican Turkey II:  
Kemalist Elite, Social Classes and Politics of Redistribution:

Keyder, Çağlar, and Faruk Birtek. "Agriculture and the State: An Inquiry into Agricultural Differentiation and Political Alliances: The Case of Turkey." *Journal of Peasant Studies* 2, no. 4 (1975): 446-63.

Keyder, Çağlar, and Şevket Pamuk. "1945 Çiftçiyi Topraklandırma Kanunu Üzerine Tezler." *Yapıt*, no. 8 (Aralık-Ocak 1984-1985): 52-63.

Arat, Yeşim, and Şevket Pamuk. "Uneven Economic Development and Domestic Politics." In *Turkey Between Democracy and Authoritarianism*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2019., 130-61. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2019.

Harootunian, Harry. "History's Interruption: Dispossession and Genocide." In *The Unspoken as Heritage: The Armenian Genocide and Its Unaccounted Lives*, 87-113. Durham: Duke University Press, 2019.

**Video:** Şevket Pamuk: Türkiye'de İktisat Tarihçiliği:

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VFQnAb-QheQ>

Week VIII: Economic History of Early Republican Turkey III:  
Kemalist Elite, Social Classes and Politics of Redistribution:

Özbek, Nadir. "Kemalist Rejim ve Popülizmin Sınırları: Büyük Buhran ve Buğday Alım Politikaları, 1932-1937." *Toplum ve Bilim*, no. 96 (2003): 219-40.

Özbek, Nadir. "Köylü Aşar Yükünden Kurtuldu." In *Cumhuriyetin 75 Yılı, Cilt 1, 1923-1953*, 46. İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları, 1998.

Önder, İzzettin. "Aşarın Kaldırılması." In *İktisat Üzerine Düşünceler*, 160-74. İstanbul: Yordam Kitap, 2011. Pamuk, Şevket. "Son İki Yüzyılda Türkiye'de Gelirin Bölüşümü." *ODTÜ Gelişme Dergisi*, no. 40 (2013): 297-316.

Week IX: Taxation as an Instrument of Primitive Accumulation I:  
Taxonomy of Fiscal Systems and Taxation:

Peters, B.Guy. *The Politics of Taxation: A Comparative Perspective*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1991.

Week X: Taxation as an Instrument of Primitive Accumulation II:  
Comparative Historical Cases:

Daunton, Martin. "Administering Taxation in Britain, 1815-1914." In *Paying for the Liberal State: The Rise of Public Finance in Nineteenth Century Europe*, 27-56. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010.

Kimura, Motokazu. 1953. "Taxation and Capital Accumulation." *The Annals of the Hitotsubashi Academy* 4 (1): 15-39. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/43751284>.

Kaldor, Nicholas. "Türk Vergi Sistemi Üzerine Rapor (1)." *Toplum ve Bilim*, no. Güz 81/Kış 82 (1982): 94-115.

Week XI: Taxation as an Instrument of Primitive Accumulation III:  
Comparative Historical Cases:

Boylan, Delia M. "Taxation and Transition: The Politics of the 1990 Chilean Tax Reform." Latin American Research Review 31, no. 1 (1996): 7-31.

Gökşen, Fatoş, Gökhan Özertan, İsmail Sağlam, and Ünal Zenginobuz. 2008. Impact of the Tax System on Poverty and Social Exclusion: A Case Study on Turkey. New Perspectives on Turkey 38: 159-179.

Week XII: Economic Development, Inequality, and Distribution:

In Search of a Social Democratic Agenda or New Technologies of Theft/Enclosure?

Buğra, Ayşe. 2007. "Poverty and Citizenship: An Overview of the Social-Policy Environment in Republican Turkey." International Journal of Middle East Studies 39: 33-52.

Buğra, Ayşe, and Kaan Ağartan. 2007. Reading Karl Polanyi for the 21st century. New York: Palgrave Macmillan. pp.1-10; 255-259.

**Video:** Ayşe Buğra ile "Temel Gelir" (Vatandaşlık Geliri) Uygulaması  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ba5pngWbsZA>

Week XIII-XIV: In-Class Presentations: